Philosophy 375

Environmental Ethics

Instructor: Paul Semm

Phone: 619-286-5254

Texts:

VanDeVeer, Donald. The Environmental Ethics and Policy Book.

Films/Documentaries:

*The Ad and the Ego Never Cry Wolf*

*Cadillac Desert Paha Sapa*

*Earth on Edge* *Walkabout*

Course Description:

Ethics is a branch of philosophy along with metaphysics, epistemology, and logic. Traditionally ethics has been concerned with morality, questions of value, right and wrong, and good and bad. Ethical theories have attempted to answer these questions on two levels: the personal, how ought a human being act towards other human beings, and the societal, how ought society be organized so that it reflects the deep moral commitments of its members.

The environmental crisis that we now face-- massive species extinction, the 'Greenhouse effect,' ozone depletion, air and water pollution, increasing toxic and hazardous waste, massive factory farming, and animal experimentation -- has raised a new set of moral questions about the relationship between human beings and the natural world. The discipline that has emerged is called environmental ethics. And it sees its task as articulating an ethical theory that explains our moral obligations and responsibilities to the natural world.

Course Goals:

1. By the end of the course, the student should have an understanding of the discipline of environmental ethics, its theoretical sources and arguments.

2. The student should also have a broader understanding of western society and its relationship to and impact on the natural world.

3. The student should also have an understanding of the discipline of philosophy and its function in shaping worldviews.

Course Evaluation:

There will be a total of two hundred (200) points in this class. Two exams with be worth sixty (60) points each. There will be a journal that will be worth sixty (60) points. The journal will include personal reflections on the ethical issues raised in the readings, lectures, and discussions. There should be a reflection on one of the assigned readings for each class session. Also I will give other assignments during the course for the journal. When the journal is submitted at the final class session, it should be typewritten, double-spaced, and a minimum of ten pages in length**.** The final twenty (20) points will be based on class participation, relevant questions and comments. Students will be required to share selections from their journal reflections on the last Thursday of class.

Course Schedule:

Date Topic Assignment

3/5 Tu Introduction: Ethics and the Prologue,

Environment in Western Thought II. Preview, White,Jr

View: *Cadillac Desert I* Vc. Rio Declaration

3/7 Th Environmental Crisis VIa. Preview, Wilson

View: *Earth on Edge* b.Myers d.Carson, Flavin

3/12 Tu Extensionism: Animal Rights III. Preview, Singer,

View: *Never Cry Wolf* Regan, Wilson

3/14 Th The Land Ethic IVa Leopold, Callicot

View: *Cadillac Desert IV*

3/16 Sa Other Cultures: Taoism and Dine

View: *Paha Sapa*

**Exam #1**

3/19 Tu Deep Ecology IVb Preview, Naess

View: *Walkabout*  Duvall and Sessions

3/21 Th Environmental Racism IVc. Preview, Shiva

View: *Trading Democracy* Plumwood VIc. Grossman

3/26 Tu Capitalism and the Environment VIc Daly, Camacho

View: *Ad and the Ego* Vb. Kelman, c. Sagoff

3/28 Th Resistance VII. Foreman, Scarce

View: *Showdown in Seattle* Claxton

\*Journal Reflections

3/30 **Journal due and Exam #2**

\*On the last Thursday of class, we will share our journal reflections.

Environmental Ethics Exam #1

1. (t/f) Scientific opinion is equally divided over the question of the greenhouse effect and human induced climate change. An example of this equally divided opinion among scientists is the IPCC versus the Leipzig

Declaration.

2.-9. Worldwatch Institute claims the environment is undergoing profound and catastrophic changes. List four of these megaphenomena and give a concrete example of each.

a.

b.

c.

d.

10.-15. Identify and explain three of the reasons the Worldwatch Institute says that we are not astonished at the environmental crisis.

a.

b.

c.

16.( m/c) The public relations industry acting as clients for oil, coal, and natural gas companies use which of the following methods to confuse people about the extent of the environmental crisis.

a. phony grassroots organizations c. a and b only

b. think tanks with "independent experts" d. front groups

e. phony petitions f. all of the above

17. Much of irrigation for agriculture depends on water pumped from underground \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

18. According to the documentary *Earth on Edge*, the "dustbowl" of the 1930s was a human induced environmental catastrophe.

19.-20.The documentary *Earth on Edge* claims that pollution runoff, pesticides, herbicides, fertilizer has made drinking water in \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

undrinkable and has created a \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ in the Gulf of Mexico.

21.-22. According to the documentary *Earth on Edge*, the federal government subsidizes anti-environmental practices. Explain.

23.-25. According to the documentary *Earth on Edge*, human activity and/or social change have caused a crisis for two ecosystems the grasslands in Mongolia and coral reefs. Choose one and explain

26. According to the documentary, *Cadillac Desert: Mulhollands Dream*, the theft of the water from the Owens River and the Owens Lake was justified by what moral principle \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

27. According to the documentary, *Cadillac Desert: Mulhollands Dream*, after Owens Lake was sucked dry the aqueduct was extended to another lake which was \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

28.-33. Lynn White, Jr. and your professor argue that there are historical causes to the environmental crisis, specifically the Judeo-Christian tradition.

Identify and explain three reasons.

a.

b.

c.

34.(m/c) The Puritans saw themselves as the new chosen people who were being tested by God. They thought the test was to turn the "new world" into a   
Garden of Eden. Which of the following was not something they did?

a. massive deforestation c. filled in marshes and wetlands

b. extermination of fur bearing d. learn about the environment

animals and game birds from the people that had

preserved it for thousands of years

35. (t/f) Your professor argued that manifest destiny was an extension of the

Judeo Christian attitude towards the environment.

36. The best "grizzly range on earth" was \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

37. One of the "greatest natural habitats for wildlife and game birds in the world was \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

38. The basis for establishing moral standing according to utilitarian ethical theory is \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

39. The basis for establishing moral standing according to Kantian ethical

theory is \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

40.-47. Identify and explain the following terms as they relate to utilitarian and Kantian theories.

a. principle of utility

b. equal consideration

c. categorical imperative

d. kingdom of ends

48. Peter Singer argues that some animals should be given equal consideration

because they can \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

49.-54. Tom Regan argues that some animals have inherent value because they

are subjects of a life. Identify the criteria for being a subject of a life. Give a specific example from *Never Cry Wolf*

a.

b.

c.

56.-57. Aldo Leopold's land ethic is an example of \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ ethic, as opposed to a Judeo-Christian ethic which is \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

58.-60. Compare and contrast Leopold's land ethic with the Lord of the Earth ethic of domination.

Lords of the Earth Leopold

a. humans are unique and qualitatively a

different and at the top of the Chain of Being

b. natural world is a resource, dead matter b.

waiting to be transformed into something

for humans

c. humans , through science can predict and c.

control

61.-66. According to Leopold, humans have the moral obligation to act in

what ways in relationship to the environment. Identify and explain.

a.

b.

c.

6

Environmental Ethics #2

1.(t/f) Deep ecologists believe that the goal of rethinking our relationship to the natural world will lead to achieving an ecological consciousness.

2. Deep ecologists refer to overcoming the isolated ego preoccupied with its narrow self-interests and identifying with other humans and the natural world as \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

3. Deep ecologists refer to the understanding that all living things are of equal inherent value including human beings as \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

4. Deep ecology Principle #8 says that those who subscribe to Principles 1-7 have an obligation to try to implement the necessary changes. The method for attaining these changes should be \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

5. The aboriginal ritual where the young male adult's journey to the sacred places of his land is called a \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

6-8. Give one example each from *Cadillac Desert: The Last Oasis* of how dams negatively effect people, communities, and nature.

a.

b.

c.

9.(t/f) According to Rev. Benjamin Chavez's study "Toxic Waste and Race in the United States," race is the most significant factor in determining who is most effected by pollution.

10-12. Sociologists, and some philosophers, make a distinction between two types of racism. They are \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ racism and \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ racism.

13.-15. Explain briefly how the types of racism differ.

16. The way in which society is layered in terms of income, wealth, and power

is called \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

17.(t/f) Where one is located in society in terms of income, wealth, and power determines one's life chances.

18. The 75 mile area in Louisiana between Baton Rouge and New Orleans is called the \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

19.-21. The urban ghetto was shaped by social transformations that left mainly minorities in an impoverished and toxic environment. Identify and explain the three main transformations.

a.

b.

c.

22.-24. Identify three of the environmental hazards faced by minorities living in the urban ghetto.

a.

b.

c.

25. The EPA treats environmental hazards differently in minority areas. Which of the following is not an example.

a. enforce laws and regulations less vigorously b. lower fines

c. slower to put toxic waste sites on Superfund list d. cover toxic waste

e. none of the above

26. The 500 years that European countries colonized and exploited the third world is called \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

27.(t/f) According to Vandana Shiva, after the breakdown of colonialism, the first world came up with a new term for exploiting the third world. It was called "development."

28.(t/f) In 1951 the Atomic Energy Commission set up an nuclear test sit within the Western Shoshone reservation.

29. (t/f) Kerr-McGee and the Atomic Energy Commission knew about the effects of working in uranium mines but did not tell the Navajo workers.

30.-33. Many of the environmental consequences of uranium mining on Indian reservations still exist. Identify three.

a.

b.

c.

34. The name of the channel that targets high school students at school is \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

35. Name brand products are visible throughout movies. This is called \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_.

36.-38. Identify and explain the three social transformations during the late nineteenth century that created the conditions for the emergence of the advertising industry.

a.

b.

c.

39. What author said "advertising is the art of teaching people to want things?

a. George Orwell b. H.G. Wells c. Sinclair Lewis d. Fitzgerald

40. Which of the following technologies was referred to as having conquered living space?

a. newspaper b. radio c. TV d. magazines

41.-44 Identify the following terms as they relate to advertising and entertainment television.

a. flow

b. pod

c. hook

d. bumper

45.-47. Identify three ways that McDonalds has targeted children.

a.

b.

c.

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Match the following type of commercial to its most appropriate example.

48. parable a. Marlboro, Virginia Slims

49. association of values b. Rogaine, Viagra

50. funny/stupid c. Money Tree, King Stalman

51. status community d. Texaco, Philip Morris

52. selling corporations e. 1-800-Call Att, Jack in the Box, Aflac

53. low income f. Lexus, Tommy Hilfiger

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

53.-55. Briefly explain NAFTA Ch 11 and the impact it may have on a countries ability to maintain a clean and healthy environment.

56-60. Compare and contrast the Lord of the Earth worldview with the Lakota worldview as expressed in the documentary *Paha Sapa*.

I. Introduction to Environmental ethics

A. Point of Departure: Two assumptions

1. Assuming as a given that there is an environmental

crisis

A. Warnings

i. 1992 Union of Concerned Scientists, 1600

including most of living Nobel Laureates

ii. 1992 Rio Earth Summit: species diversity and Co2

iii. Worldwatch Institute "there is not one

life support system upon which the biosphere

depends for its existence that is not severely

threatened and getting worse 1993

iv. 1995 Intergovernmental Panel on

Climate Control 2500 climatologists from

60 countries

"widespread economic, social, and environ

mental dislocation over next century"

iii. 1997 UN Report on global assault - same level of assault or worse

iv. 1998 US Geophysical Union 35,000 scientists human induced global warming

a serious threat

v. 1997 Kyoto Accords and the Hague all countries except US agree UCS "call to action"

vi. 1998 NASA record for temperature

vii. 1999 directors of US National Oceanic

and Atmospheric Administration and

British Meteorological Office "ignoring climate

change will surely be the most costly of

all possible choices, for us and our children"

vii. NAS global warming is undoubtedly real

and occurring at a rate 30% faster than

originally estimated By IPCC

vii. 2001 Un Intergovernmental Panel

on Climate Control greater than predicted

2. World Watch Institute: Five global megaphenomena

a. rising CO2 and other human produced

greenhouse gases causing climate change

i. discussed among scientists since 1957,

greenhouse effect

ii. 1988 public discussion Dr. James Hansen

NASA Goddard Institute for Space Studies

iii. causes auto exhausts, coal-burning power

plants, factory smokestacks six billion tons

of carbon dioxide into earth's atmosphere

each year

iv. more extreme weather, rising sea levels,

changing precipitation patterns, ecological and

agricultural dislocation, spread of human disease

b. massive species extinction

c. excessive consumption of resources

d. population explosion

e. massive chemical pollution

B. Second assumption this raises significant and novel questions about human beings and their relationship to the environment

1. Raises questions regarding values, questions of right

and wrong, good and bad, how we ought to live our

lives, how society should be organized and what policies to pursue

2. These are all traditionally philosophical questions, and

most are questions having to do with the branch of philosophy known as ethics

3. The origin of philosophy and philosophical ethics is

with Socrates

a. how ought I live my life

b. began by questioning the basic assumptions

of his society in regard to their beliefs, values,

customs

c. suggested the unexamined life is like living in

a cave "The Allegory of the Cave"

4. We will use Socrates as our model and question the

norms, values, ideals, practices of each of us and our

society in relation to the environment

C. Worldwatch Institute - "Why we are not astonished"

1. Americans believe in their god given right to consume

a. Americans specifically 5% of population, 70%

of hazardous waste, 25% of greenhouse gases

b. America through globalization is exporting

this ethos of consumption

c. advertising and marketing targeting children

i. create a consumer psyche that organizes life around hyperconsumption

ii. conceals environmental costs of consumption

2. spend most of our time in artificial environments

a. malls, stadiums, theme parks, gyms

b. alienated from environment and knowledge about it

3. Corporate news and corporate Pr

a. corporate owned and advertising sponsored

b. news is for profit

i. Kolata and NY Times

ii. Our Stolen Futures 4000 studies 400

scientists

c. PR

i. Toxic Sludge is Good for You

ii. Trust Us We're Experts

D. Pr and global warming

1. accepting the truth about global warming is threat

to profits of oil, coal, auto, and manufacturing industry

2. spent millions of dollars on PR to debunk global warming

3. create confusion so that people believe that it is really

controversial

4. 1989 Global Climate Coalition created by Pr firm

Burston-Marsteller, chr by William O'Keefe of the

American Petroleum Institute

a. members Chevron, Exxon, Ford, Chrysler, GM,

Shell

b. since 1994 spent $63 million plus to combat

progress in dealing with climate change

c. this is in addition to lobbying and campaign

contributions by the same industries

i. in 1998 oil and gas $58 million lobbying

ii. environmental groups 4.7 million on all

issues

d. method

i. glossy handouts

ii. heavy lobbying at international conferences

5. ICE Information Council for the Environment

a. front group for coal, oil, and power plants

b. created Scientific Advisory Panel

c. Fred Singer, Patrick Michaels, Robert Balling,

Sherwood Iso

i. all have conflict of interest

ii. received from $150,000 to $300,000 from

industry

iii. Singer is now consultant for ARCO, Exxon

iv. they all write letters to the editor, do

interviews, and testify in Congress as if they

are independent

v. they have little standing as scientists, they

don't do research, and if they do, it is not

published in peer reviewed journals

6. other groups

a. Global Climate Information Project

i. Chemical Manufacturers Association

ii. 13 million on newspaper and tv ads

b. The Coalition for Vehicle Choice

i. pretends to be grass roots, but front group

for auto manufacturers

ii. budget in 1993 was $2.2 million all from

big three auto makers

c. The National Center for Public Policy Research

i. industry funded think tank

ii. assistance to journalists seeking interviews

with experts

d. The Advancement of Sound Science Coalition

i. funded by chemical industry

7. The other side - four petitions

a. Heidelberg Appeal 1992 4000 scientists and

72 Nobel Prize winners

b. global warming is myth, pesticide poisoning is

a myth, anti-biotic resistant diseases is a myth

c. only problem is the text doesn't say any of this,

statement affirming science and reason

b. Leipzig Declaration signed by 110 people and

mentioned in most US newspapers as example of

other side

i. 25 signers were TV weathermen

ii. dentist, medical laboratory researcher,

civil engineer, and amateur meteorologist

iii. 33 Euro signers 4 not found, 12 denied signing, medical doctor, nuclear scientist,

expert on flying insects

iv. 20 had anything to do with climate change

and many of those had receive money from

Euro industries

C. Oregon Petitions

i. appeared to be reprint of article prepared

by, for NAS, with cover letter from 60s pres

ii. not a reprint of article, never published,

never peer reviewed, no standing, declared

ozone depletion a hoax

iii. NAS issued a denial and "greenhouse

warming poses a potential threat sufficient

to merit prompt responses

iv. 16,000 signatures anyone can sign, Frank

Burns, BJ Honeycutt

v. most scientific signers were physicists not

geophysicists, climatologists, or

8. American Petroleum Institute reported in NY Times

a. $5 million to maximized the impact of scientific

views the same as ours

b. $600,000 to cultivate and train five respected

climate scientists "independent" for media outreach

4. Specialization of scientists

a. experts more and more specialized

b. more and more tied to large corporations that fund research and academic chairs

II. Judeo-Christian traditions

A. Dominant religious tradition share same text, the OT, and

the Hebrew Scriptures

B. This tradition is highly anthropocentric

C. Bible - Creation story

1. God said, "Let us make man in our own image . . . let

them be masters of the fish of the sea, the birds of

heaven, the cattle, all the wild beasts, and all the

reptiles that crawl upon the earth

2. Later, "Be fruitful and multiply, fill the earth and

conquer it . . . I give you all the seed=bearing plants

and all the trees with seed bearing fruit

3. man also had the power of naming and "each was

to bear the name the man would give it."

D. Bible: the image of wilderness vs the Promised Land

1. Adam and eve banished from Eden into a wilderness

2. "Accursed be the soil" "It shall yield you brambles,

and thistles, and you shall eat wild plants"

3. Moses and Israelites wander in wilderness before they find the Promised Land

E. Bible: Later in the New Testament

1. Jesus spends 40 days in wilderness where it is the place of the devil and temptation

2. Paul continually emphasizes the spititual vs the body

F. Church fathers

G. Institutionalized Christianity

1. Destroyed environment of Europe

a. deforested and overgrazed

i. England deforested by eleventh

ii. Europe deforested by 16th

iii. Spain overgrazed by 15th

b. polluted rivers and streams and siltation

c. loss of arable soil

d. overhunting and overfishing

i. depeleted much of Med and Baltic

ii. exterminated right whales by nineteenth

iii. hunting for sport

e. animal torture sports thrived in church controlled

Europe

i. bearbaiting

ii. cockfighting

iii. bull fighting

f. live vivesection

g. killed cats because they were the devil

h. Churches defense of animals

i. St. Augustine: animals are beyond the scheme of salvation

ii. Aquinas who thought the world was God's creation, thought that meant everything was for man "Differences Between Rational and Other Creatures"

a. creation is hierarchy

b. mankind qualitatively unique, reason and intellect in image of God

c. animals are like slaves, they can be

used for the sake of the creatures with an intellect "Therefore every other creature is naturally under slavery, the intellectual nature alone is free."

d. Hereby is refuted the error of those who said it is sinful for a man to kill dumb animals . . . Hence it is no wrong for man to make use of them, either by killing or in any other way whatever."

i. ignorance and fear

i. no artwork or paintings or poems that

showed appreciation

ii. mountains are hideous

iii. monsters and hell creatures

" the earth is filled with restless dread"

H. Protestant Christianity - Protestant Ethic and the Spirit

of Capitalism

1. supported early capitalism and the disenchantment of the world

2. material world exists only as a place of accumulation,

3. success in world meant, perhaps, God's grace in afterworld. Calvinism

C. Puritans, colonists, and pioneers carry on this war against nature.

1. Puritans saw a "hideous and desolate wilderness"

a. wild, immoral, the devil's own "servants of satan", 'demons from hell",

b. religious practices 'confusion among the damned"

c. hellish fiends and brutish men

2. Saw themselves as the new "chosen people" and that

they were being tested by God

3. As the new chosen people they needed to change this

wildnerness into Garden of Eden - new Jerusalem

4. reclaim the "wild" for God, John Winthrop in 1629

Why remain in England and "suffer a whole Continent

. . . to lie in waste without improvement

5. what does this mean environmentally

i. greatest deforestation in human history

half a million acres

ii. extermination of those whose environmental

practices had created this "paradise"

iii. extermination of most fur bearing herbivores

by 1640, deer and moose

iv. extermination of most game birds

v. filled in marshes and wetlands

"All in all, the presence of just a few hundred thousand of the European branch of the human species, within just a centruy after its landing did more to alter the environment of NA than many millions of the American branch had done in fifteen centuries or more."

D. Manifest destiny and the war against the environment

1. God has ordained the white man to conquer the

continent

2. defined as war in diaries, letters, addresses, "enemy"

"conquered", 'vanguished", "subdued," by the "pioneer

army"

3. by 1830 same attitude, natural world needs to be

cultivated, it's God's will - Senatory Lewis Cass

4. Same year Gov of Mich, wilderness is waste, proper

relationship to it is exploitation, quoted Genesis

5. 1950s and advocates of giant damn on Colorado

River "conquering wilderness" and "subduing the earth"

6. as late as 1965 article in Saturday Evening Post

talked of civilization being defined in terms of war

with dark forces of nature

7. most large carnivores wolves, bears, mountain lions

had bounties put on them and were nearly extinct in

lower 48 states

Luther Standing Bear: "We do not think of the great open plains, the beautiful rolling hills, and the winding streams with tangle growth as ‘wild.’ Only to the white man was nature a ‘wilderness’ and only to him was the land ‘infested’ with ‘wild’ animals and ‘savage’ people. To us it was tame . . . . not until the hairy man from the East came and with brutal frenzy heaped injustices upon us and the families we loved was it ‘wild’ for us."

8. Kill everything in sight

a. multiple species of whales in bays and lagoons and staggering assortment of sport fish and

marine mammals - sea otters

b. beavers in creeks and streams

c. antelope, deer, badgers, bighorn sheep

d. spotted and red lynx, mountain lions, and jaguar

e. gray wolves and "the best grizzly range on earth"

f. golden and bald eagles, condor, flocks of migrating birds (83 separate species) that blacken the sky

g. Orange county: "one of the greatest natural habitats for wildlife and game birds in the world

h. 22 million acres of finest virgin grassland left in

the world

9. The comprehensive looting and destruction of this

extraordinary biological endowment was the basis for

the development of LAs regional economy

a. 1803-1813 killed 50,000 sea otters for fur

b. same period trapped most beaver, mink, and

river otter

c. cattle destroyed the grasslands

i. quintuple erosion rates

ii. scarred the land with arroyos

d. 1812 killed 30,000 wild horses

e. antelope pushed out of environment by cattle

and gray wolf too

f. grizzly bear hunts

i. grizzly meat a delicacy, pays from adults

and meat of babies

ii. one posse alone killed 22 bears

g. between 1865 and 1890 50%- 90% of

California's game killed off

i. one million ducks, 20,000 per year

ii. quail, doves, rabbits, deer

h. California condor "lassoed and dragged and

strangled when full of food and clumsy, or

shot just for sport

i. big game hunters spent up to $3500 in 1920s to shoot mountain lions, imported tigers, leopards, and jaguars from zoos that were chained to poles

j. 1914-15 federalized extermination of wolves,

coyotes, mountain lions, bobcats, raptors

i. predators were cruel, they murdered

innocent deer and songbirds, wanton killers

ii. "large predatory mammals destructive to

livestock and game no longer have a place

in our advancing civilization"

k. war on cougars in CA Oct 1907 $20 bounty

l. one decade in CA

i. 674 cougars, 3,000 coyotes, 120 bobcats

ii. consequences, deer population 3,000 to

100,000 between 1906 and 1924

iii. Nov 1926 one hundred million mice overran

the town of Taft, reason killed all the predators coyotes, skunks, red tail hawks

III . Science and Technology -- other countries used technology but for most values (religions) would prohibit the type of violent behavior and exploitive behavior that our culture had directed at nature (Buddhism, Taoism).

A. Early science totally disregarded animal suffering on

huge scale - Descartes

1. two substances - mind and matter

2. humans both mind and matter therefore a

soul

3. animals automata or machines, just matter in

motion

B. Scientific world view

1. God's eye view of the world, not seen through

superstitions

2. humans qualitatively different than other living

and non-living, by being self-conscious and reasoning

3. Special and unique standing for humans

a. through reason can shape their world

b. moral standing which gives them rights

3. natural world is matter in motion follows the laws

of nature

a. no inherent value

b. no rights

c. disenchanted

4. through science man

a. understand the laws of nature

b. use the laws of nature to

i. create technologies of power

ii. to shape his world - predictions and control

5. animals live below the threshold of self-consciousness

and reason, no rights no moral standing

6. other societies are "primitive"

III. Environmental Crisis

I. Ecology: the environment is a complex system of mutually interactive ecosystems.

A. Throughout these systems there is a complex interaction between biotic and abiotic elements.

B. There are no independent parts or isolated parts. Human beings are not outside the ecosystem; it acts upon them; they act upon it in unpredictable, uncontrollable ways

C. Complexity is a value because it enhances stability

D. the effects of human encroachment on these ecosystems by industrialized society has increased 1000x, especially since the 1950s

E. We do not have one single problem; we have a variety

of problems, interrelated

D. World Scientists Warning to Humanity, over 1500

Nobel Prize winners and members of national science

academies, present rate of assault on the environment cannot continue without vast human misery and a planet

so irretrievably mutilated that it will not be able to sustain life as we know it.

F. Worldwatch Institute " not one life-support system upon which the biosphere depends for its existence that is not threatened and getting worse"

G. The Failure of Rio, global environmental conference

1. WSJ congratulated US delegation on keeping the

conference from coming to any substantial

agreement

2. Two treaties

i. biodiversity - US wouldn't sign

ii. greenhouse gases - everyone signed no one

will meet the limits

iii. US kept military out of play, major polluter

in the world, one ton of toxic waste is

produced by the US military every minute

H. US Geophysical Union, 35,000 scientists

I. Kyoto Protocol

I. Land and water

A. Loss of arable land

1. loss of topsoil

a. 24 to 26 billion tons per year lost

2. desertification

a. 5 to 14 million hectares each year (VS '99)

b. Sahara has expanded 81 miles from 1980-90

c. Algeria, Tunisia, Morocco

d. deserts out of rainforests

3. marginalization

a. 50 million acres additional each year that cannot

support farming or grazing

B. Water

1. underground aquifers which provide water for

irrigation are being depleted faster than

a. irrigated land is 17% of land but 40% of

food

b. China, India, souther Great Plains in US

2. Mountain glaciers are melting more rapidly

C. Practices

1. monocrop farming with row plowing

2. overgrazing

3. farming marginal land

4. irrigation

5. oil drillin and mining

6. suburban sprawl

a.Silicone Valley built over the world's largest

continuous orchard, 8,000,000 flowering trees

b. topsoil 40 feet deep

D. Consequences

1. challenges our capacity to feed ourselves

2. one billion people will eventually suffer absolute

water scarcity by 2025 (VS '99)

II. Worlds Forests

A. Destruction of Rainforests and old growth forests

1. lost 1/2 of world's forest since 1960, 2/3rds since

the Industrial Revolution

2. 55,000 square miles a year of rain forest --

3. Global 2000 Report - all forest that is accessible in

Third World will have been cut by 2020

4. Rainforests drying out because of warming and

changing weather patterns

B. Practices

1. burning and bulldozing rainforests

a. timber

b. cattle grazing

c. farming

d. palm plantations and soybean farming

e. roads, damns for mining operations, widening

river channels

f. fuel

2. roundwood for industry temperate and boreal forests

a. 77% used by first world (VS)

b. 2x as much as 1950

c. paper mills - US is leading paper producer and

consumer 330 kilograms per person - 1 kilo African

d. construction

C. Consequences

1. greenhouse

a. forests as carbon sinks

b. don't absorb methane, nitrous oxide, hydro

flourocarbons, perfluorocarbons

2. desertification

3. extinction of animal and plant species

4. smoke cloud from burning forests in Indonesia and

rest of SE Asia, hundreds of thousands of square miles

eight countries

a. air index equal 800 - dangerous - no rating

over 500

b. burned rain forest 1997 8000 square miles

c. 20 million people treated for respiratory

illnesses

d. Orangutangs infections and respiratory ailments

e. burning by agribusiness - 29 large corps

i. clear-cutting for timber

ii. burn brush

iii. huge palm plantations for palm oil,

soaps, salad dressings, desserts

iv. Good Hope co. 15 sq miles a night,

50 mile by 50 mile palm plantations

v. health hazards

vi. Surharto more clear cutting permits

5. 150years to 1000 years depending upons how it was destroyed

6. leaves exposed parts of forest more susceptible to

destruction, i.e., Hurrican Mitch

7. can't burn the forests without destroying broad

ecosystems

8. Paper production is 3rd most toxic industry and creates 38% of municipal solid waste, chlorine, dioxin, arsenic

1.Mitsubishi is largest destroyer of rainforests,

a. operations on most continents, where

it destroys forests, cultures, broken

international law, evaded taxes

b. Penan, Kayan, Kenyan, Kelabit, and Iban

peoples have fought to save their homelands

c.. Alaska Tongass national forest, laws

violated antitrust, environmental, labor

d. Alberta, Canada 40,000 acres of Aspen

clear cut each year to feed their mill

e. Brazil - mill which purchase illegally cut

timber

f. supports a violently repressiv military

regime in Burma with cash for natural gas

and teakwood

g. Malaysia - attempting to uproot the indigenous people

2. Lack of enforcement and collusion

a. Headwater groves - old growth redwood forests

i. $480 million to Pacific Lumber 4x, cited

over 200x for violations

ii. 10,000 acres, not old growth, some already

clear-cut, second growth stands, 40% ogrowth

iii. could have stopped logging with Endangered Spiecies ACt

iv. instead granted him a by on EDAct

for 211, 000 acres

v. allowed to destroy habitat of 36

wildlife species

vi. continue logging on steep slopes

b. Fisher family

i. the Gap, Banana Republic, Old Navy

ii. Mendocino Redwood (formerly Louisiana Pacific) - director on National

iiiResource Defense Council

iv. owns over 1/2 of all

v. liquidation logging

clearcutting

toxic herbacides

vi. 2x sustainable rate

vii. habitat for endangered species

viii. $300,000 political contributions buys ok

from Dept of Forestry

3. Suriname

a. poor country with rain forests

b. pressured by TNCs to sell, use bribery of officials

c. $28 million to corporations only $2 million to

Suriname

a. no reforestation

b. no monitoring

c. displace three indigenous people

III. Species Diversity

A. Great extinction

1. 1.5 million categorized species, perhaps as many

as 30 million, mostly in rain forests

2. background extinction rate 1 species every few years

according to text over 1000 per day due to human

B. monoculture - loss of food diversity

1. India 30,000 strains of rice 10 by 2005

2. US only 7 varities of corn, 9 of wheat

3. Third world 1 acre a 100 different varieties of

crops and strains of potatoes

C. birds of prey, birds and insects, pollination

1. 9600 bird species, 1000 face extinction,

and 70% declining

2. 50 million songbirds on the dinner table in Italy

3. increase in concentration of pests

D. Fish

1. 73% of world's major fishing areas and 70% of major

fish species are at peak production or decline

2. on Ca coast some species have declined 90%

since 1960s

3. White abalone down to 1600 from millions could

be first Marine Invertebrate to be Endangered

Species

C. Practices

1. destruction of habitat

2. pesticide use does more damage to the natural

predators than to the pests, in last 35 years pesiticide use has increased 10x, yet crop loses to pests have doubled

3. monocrop farming

4. over fishing and illegal fishing

D. Consequences

1. Not just extinction

2. loss of species diversity weakens ecosystems

3. stability of biosphere is proportionate to complexity

4. Example

a. overfishing pollock, depletion of pollock and

b. 90% decline in sea lion population which

feeds off pollock, designatied Endangered

c. killer whales eat sea lions, so now they eat

sea otters

d. sea otters have declined by 90% since 1990

e. surge in sea urchins

IV. Indigenous People

A. Cultures did and still inhabit the rain forest

1. destruction of the rainforest is destroying their

way of life

2. these people are resisting, in the courts, protests,

etc.

B. Basically they are ignored in mainstream media

1. Americans don't want to know that their life style

kills people

V. Overpopulation

A. Population growth

1. the worlds population is 6 billion with a growth rate of about 1.5 % or 90million per year. The highest rate of growth is in the poorest countries.

2. there is however a disproportionate impact on the environment relative to wealthy countries and poor countries.

3. The problem of hunger is a third world problem where

1.5 million live in abject poverty and 15 million children

die each year

B. Future

1. world's population will increase by one billion in 10

years

2. increasing hunger will put more pressure on land,

farming marginal land, cutting down forests

C. Causes

1. there is a direct correlation between poverty and

fertility, fertility is social security for poor

2. correlation between poverty and the exploitation

of third world's labor and natural resources

3.no "development" poorest 50 countries poorer than

they have ever been, biggest gap between rich and poor

VI. Air Pollution

A. Air pollution, greenhouse effect, ozone depletion

1.400 counties exceed federal air pollution standards

2. 140 million Americans exposed to harmful air each day

3. Carbon and Co2 have created Greenhous effect

4. CFCs have depleted the Ozone

5. 185 studies conclude that air pollution is getting worse

6. US Industry 1.3 billion pounds of toxins earch year

B. Practices

1. auto

a. carbon monoxide, carbon dioxide, nitrous oxide,

CFCs and ozone smog

b. carbon emissions 6.4 billion tons, since 1950

200 billion tons, 1990- 98 US + 11.8%

c. largest jump in global CO2 in 98 since data

was collected

2. coal, oil, and gas power plants and incinerators

a. nitrous oxide and sulphur dioxide

3. industrial plants and incinerators

a. fine particle pollution soot

4. construction

b. coarse particle pollution

5. burning of tropical forests

C. Consequences

1. 60,000 Americans die prematurely of related

diseases respiratory and cardiac, Harvard Medical

School

2. levels 200-400 x greater than Clean Air Act, LA and Orange county - cancer causing no agency affiliated with monitoring air quality released these numbers, it was a congressional study

3. 250,000 children with asthma the leading casue of children being admitted to hospitals

4. China alone 3,000,000 deaths from air pollution

between 1994 and 1996

5. children in India and China unhealthy levels of lead

VII. Greenhous effect

1. Human induced climate change

A. IPCC (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change)

B. NASA new record in 1998

C. acceleration of greenhouse gases

D. last decade is warmest in 600 years according

to Nature magazine

2. consequences

a. melting of polar glaciers, Greenland, and Himalyas about 1 meter rise

i. two billion people at risk and the value

and productivity of the land

ii. souther coast of Med, west coast of Africa,

south Asia (India, Bang, maldives), low lying

coral atolls in Pacific and Indian oceans, and

SE Asia

iii. US study on east and gulf coast 1 meter

rise would flood 3.6 million hectares

iv. IPCC study of five east coast LA countries

13.5 million hectares and 750,000 people

v. study: 40-50% of world's remaining wetlands gone by 2080, drainage from ag,

urban sprawl, 1 meter sea level rise

vi. mangrove forests: largest in India, Sunderbans, home to 315 species of birds,

Rhesus macaque, Irrawaddy dolphin, and

Bengal tiger, plus one half million people

c. more violenct weather, storms, hurricanes, warmer air greater moisture carrying capacity

d. 92 billion in weather related damage in 1998

e. El Nino and la Nina bleaching and destroying

coral reefs, ocean temperature rising .3 degrees

C each decade, .5 in tropics

f. Artic

i. 10% reduction in area covered by ice

ii. 40% decline in thickness

iii. could b ice free in summer

E. Ozone depletion

F. WAIT A SECOND --**Government --**

1. EPA lost 1 billion in funding and 750 employees, is only able to collect 20% of fines,

2. govt forced finally by court order to institute new regualtions, not until 2002, actually 2012, decreased standards.

3. Clinton administration, wanted tocut standards 30 to 50% on soot and softer sanctions, decreased ozone standards by 20%, and changed formula for how smog is measured which help major cities get by the standards

4. Arco and Southern California Edison big supporters

5. not even in effect until 2002 then no fines until

2012, 360,000 lives lost

6. Federal judge overturnned

7. American Petroleum Institute, urban smog is no big deal people actually seem to adjust to it

8. REp Tom DeLay, we need to overhaul Clean Air Act and

strip the EPA of its power

G. Gatt and the air

1.The country of Venezuela challenged some of US regulations regarding the our clean air act.

2. A three-judge WTO panel invalidated the US regulation

"WTO members were free to set their own environmental objectives, but they were bound to implement these objectives only through measures consistent with WTO provisions.

3.Therefore we are to pay (that is you and I) Venezuela 150 million per year or change.

VII. Water

A. Water Pollution

1. various contaminants put into water which contaminate it for human use

B. Practices

1 municipalities and industries, between 100,000 and 200,000 dumpdirectly into the sewage system, rivers, or lakes

a. human and animal waste

b. toxic chemicals: lead, asbestos, detergents, solvents, acid, amonia, chemicals,

2. agricultural runoff,

a. pesticides, herbicides, fertilizers,

b. increasingly high concentrations of **animal waste** because of factory farming.

3. Oil spills

Dependence on importing fossil fuels creates the possibitlity of Exxon Valdez.

4. Domestic lawn runoff has extremely high concentrations of pesticides and herbicieds

5. Biological and pharmaceutical waste

6. landfill seeping into ground water

C. Consequences

1. 14 million Americans drinking herbicide laced water

2.1.7 billion in third world do not have safe drinking water, another 3 billion are at risk, high death from cholera, typhoid, dysentery, diarrhea

"The bigest slum in the world maybe Dharavi, a vast shantytown in Bombay, where hundreds of thousands of people live in hovels connected by tiny meandering alleys. Sewage runs in the paths along with the rats."

3. Worst in US is Mississippi river and 150 miles located in Louisiana where 25% of nations chemical industry is located, and the nation's largest polluter (Dow) "cancer corridor" highest rates of cancer and infant deaths

4. Ocean --

a..dead zones increasing chemical pollution

b. neuston .

5 bays - 75% of commercial fishing CA

6. wetlands and estuaries (9%of CAs left)

Surprise -

I. The Black Sea

A. 1972 Dam on the Danube River between Romania and Serbia,

1. generate electricity

2. control the natural floodplain of the river

B. consequences

1. Danube contributes 70% of fresh water and

80% of silicate to Sea

2. silicate is consumed by diatoms, tiny single

celled algae that fuel the food web

3. new silicate is required, but now back behind

the dam

4. simultaneously, increase in nitrogen and phosphorus

pollution from fertilizer runoff and from the sewage

of the 160 million people who live in Black Sea drainage

5. lack of silicate kept diatoms from 'blooming" but not

"red tide" organisms that produce powerful toxins

C. Oops! welcome to globalization

1. jellyfish native to Atlantic accidentally released from

ballast tank of ship

2. ate all the zooplankton which fed on algae

3. red tide boom consumed oxygen on surface

4. no oxygen below 200 meters, below is reservoir of

dissolved hydrogne sulfide gas

5. dead fish - asphyxiated or poisoned

Also, The mollusks, sponges, sea urchins, een the marine worms are disappearing. The shallows, where vast beds of seagrass once breathed life into the waers, are regularly fouled in a fetid soup laced with a microbe that thrives in such conditions: cholera

II. Surprise II - Coral Reefs

A. Reefs are massed calcareous skeletons of millions of coral -

small sedentry worm-like animals that live on the reef

surface, filtering the water for edible debris - tropical and

subtropical water and host plants and animals

B. Second richest biome next to rain forests, 1/4 of all

ocean species, incl 65% of marine fish species

C. susceptible to heat stress and the high sea surface

temperatures (SSTs)

D. bleaching

1. when the temp is to high corral expels aglae that

lives within

2. needs algae to help feed it through photosynthesis

3. 90s and last year 98 most extensive bleaching to date

a. every area affected

b. 70% of coral killed in Indian Ocean along

African coast

E. Consequences

1. crown-of-thorns starfish are eating their way

threw corals

2. overfishing is also aiding this by depleting the

fish that eat the starfish

3. nitrogen-rich agricultural runoff and sewage runoff

promote algae growth

4. algae growth starvs coral of light and colonizes

the coral

5. Jamaica coral reefs, 90% off northwest coast are

algae covered humps of limstone

6. coral diseases 1996 9 of 44 corl species diseased in

reefs off Florida, 1997 28

F. Consequences II the shared ecosystem

1. coral protects narrow band of water between it

and shore - sea grass

2. this sea grass protects coral and is home to 70%

of commercially important fish at one time or another

3. sea grass beds are silting under sediment from

logging, mining, and shrimp farms

4. loss of mangroves in warmer regions, knit sea

and land, trap sediment and stabilize coast lines, roots

are fish nurseries

i. esp devasting in se asia

ii. Indonesia

III. Other surprise

A. Nitrogen pollution has triple the occurenc of low-oxygen

dead zones in coastal ocean waters over the last 30 years

1. tocix algae species 20 to 85

B. Organochlorine pollutants create immunodeficiencies in

marine mammal, viral epidemics

C. hunting birds and primates in tropical forests (Indonesia)

they pollinate flowers and disperse seeds

D. powerful storms which are on the increase spread exotic

plants over wide areas

E. global decline of amphibians, habitat loss, pollution, disease, exotic predators, higher levels of UV exposure

VIII. SOLID WASTE POLLUTION

A. problem: our society of hyper consumerism, built-in obsolesence, throwaway, packaging has created a junk problem

B. extent of problem --

1. each year -- 13 billion tons of solid waste (50 tons) per person, 10 million computers, 220 million tires, and 16 billion disposable diapers (2 % of solid waste). Not currently biodegradable, 3 million tons of untreated feces and urines end up i landills .

2. losing landfill space, for every one opened, four close down, the one NY receives 44 million pounds every day.

3. Also, companies dump illegally in landfills, toxic and hazardous waste, which seeps into groundwater.

4. all landfills leak, with toxic waste seeping into ground and eventually contaminating drinking water and crops

C. Causes

1. to live is to overconsume, profit

2. overpackage, multiple package, plastic (PVC)

3. throwaway consumerism

4. dynamic and planned obsolescence

5. limited recycle

a. 11% of computers recycled

b. monitor 8lbs of lead

c. Motherboard 700 toxic substances, incl mercury,

cadmium, chromium

IX. CHEMICAL POLLUTION

A. 500 million tons of chemicals into biosphere each year

1. 20 million registered chemical with Chemical Abstract Service and 3 new each day

2. 60,.000 in regular use,

3. 80% no info concerning effects on environment,

animals or humans

4. 20% we know about

a. 4.81 billion pounds are toxic

b. 408.3 are known or suspected carcinogens

c. 1.2 billion lbs birth defects

B. These chemicals are ubiquitous, they are used in the production process, they are in the products, they are by-products of the products

1.PCBs in the Hudson

2. Dioxin the supertoxin, should it be regulated

by eliminating PVC from production

a. Not according to the Vinyl Institute, pay scientists to say ($130,000), scientific study is not very scientific

b. The ease with which the EPA accepts self-serving

industry-sponsored research as the basis of its

regulations

3. Love Canal

4. food - richer, moister, preserve - 1000 miles

5. clothes - Tris - in childrens clothing

6. worker exposure

a. 100,000 deaths from worker exposure

b. IBM

7. chemical accidents - Bhopal, India Dec 3, 1984

Union Carbide, US company

a. release of deadly gas from pesticide storage

plant - methyl isocyanate

b. killed 8,000 people, 300,000 injured many

permanentlys

8. before accident

a. own investigating team "serious potential for

sizeable release of toxic materials"

i. coolers not functioning, scrubber system

down, previous leaks

ii. employess not trained

iii. didn't warn down right away when leak

occurred

b. cost benefit, each life worth $85oo, divested

themselves so they didn't have to pay damages

9. Union Carbide in W. V. 221 violations and site of

smaller leak

10. 75% of Americans live close to chemical plant

C. Toxic Waste, EPA, and Profit

1. 1250 EPA super fund to clean up most toxic sites

2. huge profits few results, 10% cleaned up correctly

3. estm that there are really another 10,000 more, total cleanup cost will be 100 billion

D. Military

1. d o defense generates more than 500,000 tons of toxins, more than top 5 chemical companies combines

2. 17,482 sites on 1855 military bases are in non- compliance with federal environmental laws.,

3.97 bases on the EPA superfund list, top 10 weapons contractors name 133x in Superfund sites

4. "sacrifice zones" Nevada Site 51, the Figi Islands

E. Global chemical pollution

1.US corps sells toxic chemicals to third world,

a. 40% of pesticides sold are sold as exports,

b. 15% unregistered.

c. Frequently, the purchasers are multi-national corporations in Third world, Standard Oil of Ca, Ortho, aldine, chlordane and DDT, Nicaragua under Somozan

2. Pay the poor to take our toxic waste, who the world system has made poor, 2 million tons

a. car batteries

b. pesticide plants to India and Egypt, E. subsidizes

its pest ind more than health care

3. One of the sites of greatest chemical contamination, and the possible site of ecological crisis is the US Mexican border and the maquiladorias

a. over 2000 dumping toxic waste, either in

water or ground

b. one of most dangerous environmental sites

in the world

F. Transporting toxic waste **--**  400 spills per year in US alone

.

Nuclear Pollution

A. Problem

1. radiation to a certain degree is natural, but the development of nuclear energy has created problems far beyond those anticipated,

2. high level radiation, death, short or long term, cancer

birth defects, liver disease, infections

3. all stages of nuclear production are dangerous

a.radons gas is released just in drilling holes, thousands left uncovered in Arizona, Wyoming, South Dakota

b.uranium tailings are byproducts of minings, left lying around (10 million tons by Colorado river,

130 acres on a flood plane, over a fault zone, leaking into river, near wildlife preserve and

National Park)

c.occupational exposure to workers who make fule rods

d. deactivating

e. accidents

i.. Chernobyl - core meltdown - 20,000

to 100,000 will die of radiation poisoning

from exposure and fallout

much of Europe highly contaminated

fish, agriculture, water, milk

contaminated wheat sold to Africa

contaminated milk in Germany

powedered and sold to Egypt and

Nigeria

ii. Sverdlovsk - accidental explosion, villages

and forests destroyed, cancer in surrounding

areas

iii. St. George Utah

iv. Novaya Zemlya, 1962, most horrifying

nuclear blast, opposed by Sakharov, fall out

heavy in Scandinavian countries

v. Three mile island- partial meltdown

vi. nuclear submarine

vii. Mayak plutonium plant dumping plutonium into Techa river, 450,000 people

effected

C. Nuclear energy as an alternative source

1. so cheap that we would no longer need to meter it

2. (also safe!!! mr. Plutonium is your friend)

3. incredible cost overrns --

4. so dangerous they cannot be insured, US government guarantees limited liability

5. 4 out of 5 plants are in non-compliance with federal safety standards

6. meltdown near populated area would be catastrophe -- 100,000 to 1million, increase in cancer and genetic defects, just like if a bomb went off

7. they are a national security problem, what if someone decides to sabotage one, ooops

8. by year 2000 2.5x more expensive than coal

9. NRC cutting back on inspections

D. Nuclear Waste

1. 477 power reactors world wide, 105 in US down from

111, plus 301 research reactors, some Chernobly types

2. US 80,000 tons of irradiated fuel and hundreds of

thousands of tons of other waste

a. millions of gallons of high level liquid waste,

34 million gallons in aging tanks

b. dangerously radioactive for thousands of years

c. paid Westinghous 500 million

d. process produces a combustible gas benzene

e. knew this from the beginning, kept funneling

money into program

f. $1 billion more?

3. Yucca mountain

a. 77,000 tons for 10,000 years

I. Ethical Extensionism

A. The social practices that raise the questions of animal rights and animal liberation?

1. Factory farming of chickens, cattle, hogs, turkeys

2. Animal Testing

a.1985 - 1994 500,000 animals died at the hands of

Proctor and Gamble alone

b. they died for hair care, oral care, laundry and cleaning, deodorants, skin products, food and beverage products,and cologne

3) these tests included, force feeding toxic chemicals,

chemicals to eyes, and shaved skin, all without sedation

4) They are resisting legislation with 17.5 million dollars,

send their material to schools

5) reason: more acceptable in law suits, even though it

yields varying results in most all cases -- SCIENCE

4. Animal experimentation LD5o, p108

1) yeah, but isn't it necessary to save human lives

2) 2/3 of bio/med discoveries with "alternate sources"

3) in polio research, reliance on the assumption that

monkeys and human correlation actually hindered

research

4) drugs, over half more dangerous than revealed in

animal testing

5) why animal testing? scientific community, gives

grants for quantifiable testing, and drug companies,

and others justify their products through animal testing

and FDA accepts this, look their were tests

5. testing Chimpanzees

1. show young affection then isolate them for rest

of life to see if isolation causes psychological problems

2. show young affection then inject with disease, if

they survive they are wharehoused for 40 to 50

years in cages 5x5x7 20/20 1995

3. The Coulson Foundation, lethal testing of pesticides,

and administering industrial solvents

4. DOD financed by us primates and dogs testing the

effects of radiation, nothing new for 30 years, also

testing of biological and chemical weapons

a. 1957 placed animals near ground zero to

test effects and different distances, let them die

slowly to watch

b. so distressed that they claw themselves and

bite hunks from their own arms and legs

5. experiment: color vision

"Stereotaxic devices are cemented, screwed or bolted onto the skulls of monkeys and cats. The "appropriate" part of the brain is exposed and for up to 44 hours, electrodes are inserted into the brain to the "desired" location whiel recordings are taken. To prevent eye movements the animals are paralyzed. Upon completion of the research project, the monkey or cat is killed and his/her brain diseected."

D. cats - balance experiments

"Wilson's research involves paralyzing cats with drugs, collapsing their lungs, inserting electrodes into their brains, and locking them into a stereotaxic frame. Wilson iserts tubes, elcetrodes, and transducers throughout the cats bodies so he can drug, shock and mnaipulate his heopless victims any way he choose. He suspends them by hip pins and a spinal clamp while cementing their heads to computer-driven head rotators. Wilson even carves open the spinal cord to expose selectee areas, and shocks them with electrodes."

2. His partner Alan Miller, does nausea experiments similar to this and drug experiments where he pumps them full of drugs induces vomiting after severingliving cats brain from spinal columns

3. UCLA Brain Research

a. kittens head's bolted to steel frames and

vivisected

b. cats forced to remain awake to exhaustion

c. one day old kittens injected with speed

d. cats surgically mutilated, paralyzed, then

unanethetized nerves shocked

e. cats tormented by shocks, flashing lights, noise

f. screws to cats skulls then repeatedly hit between

the eyes with mechanical hammer

g. cat in body bag, lying in own feces and urine

h. kittens hearing destroyed, then kitten placed

in isolation chamber untile 30 cries are heard

E. crack cocain is addictive, and old monkeys don't

learn as well as younger monkeys

D. Animal Prisons - for profit and entertainment - Sea World

1. 20 out of 25 Orcas captured by Sea World have died,

they live an avg of 6.5 years, Orcas have permanent

families with which they live for their 60 to 90 years

2. capturing -- dolphins are attacked by a fleet of boats

and chased to shallows where exhausted they can't

escape, netted and dragged onto boats in the search for

the perfect dolphin, the rest are thrown back, some die

of shock, or of pneumonia from getting water in their

blow holes. The lucky dolphin will be trained to entertain humans will die in 2 years, or 5. 8 avg

3. captured animals die of stress related illnesses, pneumonia, ulcers, or because of chlorination in their

tanks go blind,

4. wild dophins swim 40 to 100 miles a day, requ

tank 24x24x6

5. breeding programs: in general, despite publicity, they

are a failure, need to keep capturing free animals

6. entertaining humans for profit, teaching children about

animals by capturing and training them to perform for

our amusement

Animal Welfar Act

A. excludes 85 - 90% of animals, excludes anything

that would change the nature of the experiment

B. the oversears Animal Pland Health Inspections Service

1) 1992-1995 Ofice of Inspector General

2) little authority and can't ensure that even minimal

enforcement

I. Peter Singer Animal Liberation

A. Liberation refers to movements that historically have

enlarged the moral sphere

B. Leopold in "The Land Ethic" gives the example of Odysseus hanging slave girls whom he suspected of misbehaving

1. slaves had no moral standing

2. slaves were property

3. rights of slave owner guaranteed in Article 4

sec 2 and the 5th Amendment

4. expanded the moral community to include all persons

5. Leopold argues that it is time to expand the moral

community to define our relationship to the land and to

the animal and plants that grow upon it.

C.. According to Singer, exclusion of animals on a par with exclusion of women and blacks -- Speciesism-- similar to racism and sexism

1. these were acceptable practices, almost natural, now we veiw them morally and legally as intolerable

2. took movements of liberation to extend the boundaries

of our moral community against both resistance and ridicule to all people

a. Marry Wollstonecroft Vindication of the Rights of

of Women 1792

b. ridiculed by most and refuted in a satire by

a distinguished Oxford philosopher Thomas Taylor

"Vindication of the Rights of Brutes"

E. Singer wants to enlarge the moral sphere to include animals

1. Singer is a bioethicist and his thought is shaped

by utilitarian thinking

2. his starting point is trying to illuminate the basis by

which we ascribe moral standing to some beings and not

others

3. if we accept his argument then we are morally obligated to cease certain practices individually and

as a society

D. Singer's argument

1. He accepts the utilitarian assumptions

a. that the scientific method can be applied to

questions of right and wrong to determine

whether actions or policies are good or bad

b. he accepts psychological hedonism and the

inference that good and bad and right and wrong

really refer to pleasure and the avoidance of pain

2. He says then that we ascribe moral standing on the basis of whether a being is sentient

a. not whether it has a soul

b. not reason and not having a language

i. children

ii. mentally retarded, can we eat, perform

experiments, take their organs

c. not race or sex

d. not just human, then would have to find common

capacity that all humans possess that animals

don't

d. but can it feel, seek pleasure and avoid pain

e. if a being suffers, there can be no moral justification for refusing to take that suffering into

consideration

3. he accepts the principle of equal consideration

a. all those whose interests are effected by an

act or policy should have those interests receive

equal consideration for determing the morality of

the action or policy

b. interests refers to whether the act or policy

will enhance their pleasure or cause them pain

c. any being with moral standing counts for one and

not more than one

4. the capacity to enjoy or suffer is a sufficient basis

for moral standing

5. because all beings that can suffer have at the very

least an interest in not suffering

6. the principle of utility: "that principle which approves or disapproves of every action whatsoever, according to the tendency which it appears to hve to augment or diminish the happiness of the party whose interest is in question."

7. The only real question according to Singer is do

animals suffer

8. if we determine that an animal is suffering there exists no moral justification for refusing to take that suffering into consideratiosn, and to count it equally with like suffering

9. We can infer from their behavior that they do indeed suffer

a. lobster

b. animals in zoo, zoochosis, pacing, walking and

playing in own feces, premature death, inability to

reproduce

c. animals in radiation tests tear at their own

bodies

9. not having a language is not sufficient not to allow them moral standing,

a. neither do children, and frequently mentally ill, or physically ill cannot communicate verbally.

10. how far down the chain; stops at oysters and insects (not me, SPiders)

11.. Therefore all sentient beings have moral standing,

12. therefore they have a right to their interestssuffering and pleasure being considered in all actions and policies

13. morality equals the consequences of actions or policies on those beings whose interests are being effected

14. an action or policy is good if it

E. Consequences

1. eating non-humans cannot be justified

2. factory farming cannot be justified

3. animal testing and animal experimentation

4. zoos, sea worlds, circuses, rodeos cannot be justified

a. a sanctuary for endangered species

i.. less than one third are endangered

ii. two thirds for display and entertainment

b. education

i. artificial environments

ii. little information on the natural habits

polar bear plunge, Gorillas, 15 miles, 500

sqare feet,

iii. rainforests without insects

c. breeding and reintroduction

i. breeding is failure need to keep capturing

free animals

ii. reintroduction is failure

E. Do we need to experiment on animals for at least medical purposes? If we treated food animals humanely is there anything wrong with eating "pieces of slaughtered non-humans?

II. Tom Regan and Animal Rights

A. Regan's argument for the moral standing of animals is rights based on Kantian moral theory

1. beings with moral standing have rights

a. life, liberty, and security

b. because moral beings are ends in themselves

i. dignity and respect

ii. equality and freedom

2. they also have duties and obligations in relation

to other moral beings

3. beings with moral standing are moral agents, moral

subjects, or subjects of a life

4. the basis for moral attribution is reason

B. Regan argues that some animals qualify should be included in the moral community, moral standing

1. if so these animals have rights

2. and these rights define the obligations and responsiblities towards them

2. it is a question of principle if animals have moral standing must be treated as ends in themselves

a. some practices towards animals are wrong in principle

b. practices treat them as means, as resources.

c. no more right to eat animal than to eat human child

E. Regan's argument

1. Some animals have 'inherent value' value in and of

themselves, separate from their use value, not merely means to some other end.

2. Regan starts by making a distinction between moral agents and moral patients.

a. Adult human beings are moral agents, moral actors, those whom we ascribe moral standing

b. human beings who are not moral actors, mentally ill, children, comatose have moral standing

c. we can't simply treat them as means

d. refers to them as moral patients

i. even though they are not conscious

ii. not rational

iii. still have moral standing

3. do some animals have something essential in

common

a. can't be just life, he says, "more than being alive, and more than being conscious

b. it is that they are "subjects of a life.'

4. What does it mean to be a subject of a life?

a. they have desires, preferences

b capacity to initiate action towards achieving

their desires and preferences

c. can act in terms of own welfare

d. emotional life together

5. Being an experiencing subject of a life is sufficient to extend moral standing

6. Many animals can be observed to act on desires,

act in terms of their own welfare, and have an

emotional life together

5. All animals, human and non-human that are subjects of a life have equal inherent value**.**

6. Justice demands that:

"We are to treat those individuals who have inherent value in ways that respect their inherent value.

7. must not treat individual with moral standing as a

means, receptical. Kant's "Kingdom of ends should include

animals"

8. As John Lennon says, "Let it be" that would reduce the most suffering

9. The whole creation groans under the weight of the

evil we humans visit upon these mute, powerless,

creatures.

10. the abolition

a. of th use of animals in science

b. the total dissolution of commercial animal

agriculture

c. the total elimination of commercial sport

hunting and trapping

III. Environmental Philosophy - critique and argument

A. The Land Ethic - Aldo Leopold 1887-1948 A Sand County Almanac (1949) essay "the Land Ethic" --

1. lays the thematic ground for the first ecocentric ethic

2. a radical rethinking of ethics in light of ecology and the sustained abuse of the environment is an absolute necessity

3. Early life a conservationsit -- nature a resource to be managed "the varmint question"

4. "Thinking Like a Mountain"

B. Leopold's extensionism

1. Leopold wants to develop an ethical philosophy that

establishes a moral relationship between humans and

the land and the animals and plants

2. his philosophy is holistic

a. define the new boundaries of the moral

community

i. basis for moral standing

ii. question of value

b. new understanding of how we should live in

this moral community - the moral "ought"

c. suggest limitations on social organization and

policy

C. Three assumptions throughout his argument.

1. it is a fact that the earth is alive not dead matter, a living world

a. reducible to physical laws

b. not reducible to quantification or the dollar

2. living world is too complex to be predictable,

a. cannot predict the consequences of our actions

b. unanticipated and unintended consequences

of our actions

i. overfishing of pollock

ii. coral reefs

iii. Black Sea

3. accepts the holistic perspective of ecology

a. everything is interconnected, interrelated

b. even man no subject outside or above the world

4. According to Leopold the conqueror role is self- defeating.

a. Unstated assumption is that the conqueror knows

all, can foresee and therefore predict and control the consequences of his actions

b. that the conqueror knows both who and what is valuable, and who and what is worthless

5. Both of these are wrong

a. the ecosphere is so complex that its workings exceed science's attempts to grasp it

b. values in a capitalist society are based on market,

on economics

c. doesn't take into account aesthetic elements,

song birds and wild flowers are valueless

e. doesn't take into account essential elements

of the ecosphere like marshes and wetlands

and tree covered hillsides that are essential to

the entire functioning of the systems

D. Leopold's argument

1. "biotic pyramid"

a. complexly organized and intricate structure of biotic and abiotic elements through which solar energy flows

b. Species of this biotic pyramid arranged in "trophic levels"

i. according to the food they eat,

ii. population get smaller as you get to the top levels, less predators the higher up on the food chain

c.. Man is not at the top. he shares and intermediate

layer with the bears, raccoons, and squirrels which eat both meat and vegetables

d. Lines of dependencey are food chains, and each species is a link in many chains

"The pyramid is a tangle of chains so complex as to seem disorderly, yet the stability of the system proves it to be a highly organized structure. Its functioning depends on the cooperation and competition of its diverse parts.'

e. The trend of evolution is to elaborate and

diversify biota in relation to the abiotic environment over a long period of time

f. the line between biotic and abiotic elements is

is very fine

i. dead trees through the work of fungi

and insects become rich soil

ii. soil then nutures living things

"Land, then, is not merely soil; it is a fountain of energy flowing through a circuti of soils, plants, and animals."

g. There is always decay and death but a return to the soil

h. the reality is a whole system

i. complex

ii. interdependent

iii. in flux

4. From this holistic understanding Leopold believes that an ethical theory, the land ethic

a. fundamental reality: the land communtiy

b. the land, its biotic and abiotic elements,

have moral standing

i. include species

ii. ecosystems

b. human beings are members of this land community with moral standing

i. not Lord of Earth

ii. but member

b. as members

i. respect for all members

ii. respect for community as whole

c. basic moral principle

"A thing is right when it tends to preserve the integrity of the integrity, stability, and beauty of the biotic community. It is wrong when it tends otherwise."

d. consequentalists

i. determine the morality of an act or

policy, its rightness or wrongness by the

effect it has on the community

ii. so complex that we can't determine the

consequences of our actions

c. actions and policies

i. Preservation of life forms and biotic and abiotic diversity necessitate that we introduce changes slowly so adaptation can be accomplished

ii. avoid introducing alien species to ecosystems

iii. human intervention should be slow and

minimal

iv. genetically modified organisms and

the precautionary principle

d. social organization

i. small self-sustaining farms

ii. local markets

E. Callicot's analysis of Leopold

1. not a moral philosophy but a practical philosophy, How would the phronemos live?

2. The natural world is so complex and complicated that the human idea of mastery of it is just a form of hubris and will eventually be self-defeating

3. humans need to relate to the environment in a different way

4. however, Callicot says, it the beginning Leopold

he says in the beginning that love etc precedes moral

behavior

5. David Hume and late Darwin -- argued that the basis for morality is feeling or sentiment,

6. moral laws, the sphere of moral behavior is articulated on the basis of natural human feelings.

7. for Darwin this is natural and evolutionary, communities organized around love, intimacy, respect for the other survived.

8. For both morality has a natural basis. Callicot argues that Leopold is saying that modern society has lost this natural feeling of love and sympathy for the natural world--need new image -- complexity, sympathy

9. did western society ever have it

10. summary:

a. moral standing: the community as a whole

i. species and ecosystems

ii. not necessarily individuals

b. basis for moral standing

i. member of the system

ii. system is basis

c. ought: to act toward system in terms of its

stability

d. social organization: small farms

I. Taoism, Dine, Lakota

A. Native American world view

1. Humans are persons, but also to natives animals

and inanimate objects are "persons"

a. animals and birds

b. but also forests, streams

2. For some the entire world is "enspirited" or

enchanted

3. Human beings are part of the world; they are not

qualitatively different

4. Non-human persons have their own social arrangements

a. no separation of humans from natural world

b. idea of community includes all

5. as part of the community they have moral standing,

rights

a. a complex system of obligations and responsibilities for humans in relation to

these other "persons"

b. the idea that humans are outside of this is absurd

c. moral and ethical responsibility to all creatures

of the community

6. even in hunter societies

a. belief in reincarnation

b. complex rituals involved in sending creature

on its way

c. to return agains

II. "Look to the Mountain" Gregory Cajete, a Tewa Indian from the

Santa Clara Pueblo

A. The land is an extension of Indian thought and being

1. "this is the place that made us"

2. "look to the mountain" which refers to the long view,

what we are doing in terms of future generations

B. Sacred orientation to place and space is key element of

Indians relationship to the natural world

C. Theology of place

1. place is not just physical but spiritual

2. Natives established a direct and enduring relationship

with the environment

3. this relationship was the basis and is reflected in every aspect of their culture, language, art, music, dance, social organization

4. adapted differently but common set of principles

a. natural universe is embedded with life and

sacredness

b. effects of living carried out with humility,

understanding, and respect for the sacredness of

the place and all living things in the place

c. theology of place: environmental understanding

was guiding mechansim for expression

d. education starts with the environment because

that is the primary relationship

D. Windows into natural affiliation or orientation to place

1. named their place in terms of natural world and

its sacredness

a. Cardinal directions in relation to facing the sun

b. three other directs, above, center, and below

2. art

a. design motives reflect the relationship between

humans and animals

b. primal symbols of nature in art forms

i. cloud motive emphasizesthe nature and

movement of water

ii. names for different kinds of rain

E. Relationships with animals

1. essential relationship was one of respect

2. also honoring the beings that gave life to a people

3. the animal kingdom is a kingdom of process and

transformation

4. animals can teach people things

5. animals are important in myths

a. reflect important role of animals

b. importance of proper relationship with the

natural world

6. hunter of good heart

a. provided for people

b. knowledge and respect for animals

c. prayers of thanksgiving to the animal

d. life is sacred, animal life begets human life

e. symbolic acts reinforce communal relationships

7. animal dances

a. maintain the balance of all essential relationships

8. Ceremonial cycles

F. relationships with plants

1. corn as an example

a. corn is a sacrament

b. representaion of life itself

c. "we are all kernels on the same corn cob"

G. Pueblo journeys

1. journeys born from the navel of the earth

2. journey upon sacred landscape, taught by certain

animals

3. pueblo and Kokopelli, seed carrier, creative spirit of

natures fertility

I. Deep Ecology

A. Deep ecology believes that something has been lost in the modern western world

1. to modern consciousness

2. to modern forms of thinking

B. The loss is the wisdom that comes with "deep experience"

1. experience that orients us to other humans and

the natural world

2. "enlightenment" in Buddhism, satori in Zen Buddhism,

wu wei in Taoism, Hozho (Beauty Way of Life in Dine)

C. The goal of deep ecologists is to point the way to recovery

of this, ecological consciousness

D. The sources of de are many, Leopold, Hinduism, Buddhism, Zen Buddhism, Taoism, Martin Heidegger's critique of western society, Native American traditions, Romanticism

E. What they have in common is this idea of a lost or forgotten experience

1. limits of scientific knowledge

2. wisdom of experience

II. There are two essential parts to this way of thinking -- a negative and a positive.

A. Deconstruct the dominant world view and its consequences

B. philosophy that will lead to ecological consciousness

III. Dominanat world view and its consequences

A. Lord of the Earth

1. humans qualitatively unique and at the top of

the hierarchy

2. natural world is standing reserve

a. a resource to be used

b. simply a means

3. science and technology give man the power to

transform the natural world

4. man can predict and control the consequences of

his transformations

5. other cultures inferior, other beliefs superstition

B. This leads to, or presupposes a separation of man and

nature

1. separation is main problem

a. illusion or maya

b. destructive and self-destructive

II. Ecological consciousness

A. Self-realization

1. separation of man and nature as given rise to

an extremely narrow conception of self

a. Tanha in Buddhism

i. narrowly self-interested self

ii. small i, small s

iii. easily swayed by conventions

b. self is alienated from what it truly means

to be human

c. goal of self realization is to take us beyond

this narrow experience of the self

2. Getting beyond involves identification with wider

set of relationships, other people, and the natural

world

3. Once one begins to identify with other beings and

places one overcomes the separation

4. self-realization leads to the realization of the self

a. as embedded in larger web of relationships,

human and natural

b. identifies on a vital level

c. I is more than body, and more than possessing

d. Australian aborigines and the Walkabout

e. "this place is part of myself" or "my relation

to this place is part of myself"

5. in Hindu Brahman is Atman

6. Once one experiences oneself, or identifies one's self

with others, transforms one's consciousness, and

therefore one's actions

7. Bhodisattava"No one is saved until we are all saved," where the phrase "one" includes not only me, and individual human, but all humans, whales, grizzly bears, whole rain forest ecosystems, mountains and rivers, the tiniest microbes in the soil, and so on, the Buddha

a. is the ideal of Mahayana ideal, "one whoe essence (sattva) is perfiected wisdom (bodhi),

b. "a being who having brought himself to the brink of Nirvana, voluntarily renounces his prize that he may return to the world to make it accessible to others.

c. Bodhisattva vows not to desert this world "until the grass itself be enlightened." The Buddha's Flower Sermon, "He simply held aloft a golden lotus."

8. To come to the Self-realization involves the process of self-identification with the larger whole, Nature. Must be identification in order for there to be compassion, sympathy, empathy.

9. Other cultures

a. Taoism

b. Navajo

10. Gandhi"turn the spotlight on yourself"

a.

b.

B. Biocentric Equality

1. self-realization involves a larger set of relationships

2. living things are part of self

3. This would mean in western terms that all organisms and entities in the ecosphere, as parts of the interrelated whole, are equal in inherent worth,

II. Eight Principles: (203)

A. The well-being and flourishin of human and nonhuman Life on Earth have value in themselves These values are independent of the usefulness of the nonhuman world for human purposes

B. richness and diversity of life forms contribute to the raelization of these values and are also values in themselves

C.Humans have no right to reduce this richness and diversity except to satisfy vital needs

D. The flourishing of human life and cultures is compatible with substantial decrease in human population. The flourishing of nonhuman life requires such a decrease

E. present human interference with the nonhuman world is excessive, and the situation is rapidly worsening

F. Policies must therefore be changed These policies affect basic economic, technological structures. The resutlting state of affairs will be deeply different from the present.

G. the ideological change is mainly that of appreciating life quality (dwelling in situations of inherent value) rather than adhering to an increasingly higher standard of living. There will be a profound awareness of the difference between big and great

H. ETHICS : those who subscribe to the forgoing points have an obligation directly or indirectly to try to implement the necessary changes

How does this translate into action? The idea of biocentric equality and the eighth principle translate into the idea of what is called "direct action" which is "non-violent" the principle of non-violence is derived from the identifiction with all things living and non-living

Ghandi satyagraha -- soul power

III. ECOLOGICAL RESISTANCE -- CENTRAL PRINCIPLE

A.DIVERSITY BOTH HUMAN AND ENVIRONMENTAL -man as a part of the whole takes personally the wounds inflicted on the body

B. resistance is necessary because of the dominance and limitations of narrow technological solutions to narrowly defined technological problems

C. the resister accepts the burden of responsibility, the burden of witnessing for the other as Self -- always non-violence -- can choose action or not, but cannot turn away in ignorance

D. embrace your opponent, convince him at the personally level of the justness of your position. Not a question of force, control, or manipulation. Thou art That. This is Hinduism and Ghandi, but the same in Taoism -- the power of one's position is the truth of that position, not one's ability to coerce

Environmental Justice/ Racism

I. The rights of persons

A. Because humans have moral standing they are guaranteed

rights

1. derived from both Kantian and utilitarian moral

theory

2. given substance in America

a. Declaration of Independence: life, liberty,

and the pursuit of happiness

b. given substance in the constitution: freedom of

speech, belief, thought, expression, person under

law

3. given broader substance in international law

a. UDHR, Convention on Economic, Cultural, and

Social Rights

b. rights include work, housing, health care, food

4. some feel environmental rights of person should be

included

a. right to clean and healthy unpolluted environment

b. is a necessary precondition to life, liberty, and

the pursuit of happiness

B. While pollution affects us all, in US and globally it affects

some people more than others

1. racial minorities

2. poor

c. indigenous people

II. Environmental justice movements have emerged, one of those is the Environmental racism movement

A. Environmental racism first used as a term by Rev. Benjamin Chavez with the release of "Toxic Waste and Race in

the United States"

B. summary of environmental racism

1. poverty important, but race most important variable in locating hazardous waste facilities

2. blacks, hispanics, native americans, Asian/pacific islanders overrepresented in communities with uncontrolled toxic waste sites

3. 5 o 6 areas of worst industrial pollution if 78%

minority

4. 50% more likely to die of exposure to hazardous

waste

C. environmental racism making a sociological distinction

1. difference between personal racism and institutional

racism

2. cause of environmental racism is institutional racism

a. personal racism

b. institutional racism

i. ways in which society's institutions are

arranged

ii. different power arrangements

iii. differential treatment and consequences

c. both US and global social arrangements are

organized in such a way

i. certain gourps are affected to a greater

or lesser degree by environmental

practices

ii. deprived of environmental rights

D. social organization

1. most societies are stratified by income, wealth, and

power

2. those at the top haave

a. access to institutions

b. control over institutions

c. power to shape society in their favor

3. conversely those at the bottom have less

access, control, power

4. literally translates into life chances

a. Titanic

b. minorities and poor higher infant mortality,

lower life expectancy, hunger and disease

c. also most affect by a society's negative

evironmental practices

E. Urban American

1. social construction of the urban ghetto

2. environmental injustice in urban area

a. highest levels of air pollution because of

concentration of traffic

i. blacks die of asthma at 3x the rate

of whites

ii. environmetal cancers

b. site of most toxic and hazardous dumps

i. south side of Chicago, toxic triangle

ii.

c. slumlording and lead poisoning

i. in Chicago ten areas with highest rate

of poisoning 70% minority, 90% of cases

ii. 37% of black urban preschoolers suffer

from lead poisoning

d. most illegal dumping is done in urban areas

i. 80% of dumping in areas that are 65%

minority

ii.

a. People of color are twice as likely to live in counties with highest levels of indusrial toxins

b. People of color are three times more liely as Whites to live near one of the largest toxic waste dumps in the country

F. Native Americans

1. dumping on reservations

2. uranium mining and nuclear testing

G. Migrant workers

1. EPA

2. DDT sprayed on workers in third world plantations

a. 2 million pesticide poisonings a year

H. EPA

1. enforces laws and regulations less vigorously

2. leviews lower fines in minority areas, 1/5

3. slower to put toxic waste sites on Superfund list

4. policy of containing waste, rather than remove it

III. global environmental justice

A. First and third world (color)

1. history of this relationship 500 years of

colonialism

2. environmental consequences were catastrophic

3. indigenous people

B. new arrangements called "free trade"

1. GATT, NAFTA, FTAA- WTO

2. limits to agreement

a. serve interests of first world/ mnc

b. severe impact on communities, people,

maquiladoras

c. lack of environmental regulations

3. "developmental" projects

a. 40% mining and oil

b. increase in % withough environmental impact

Examples,

A. Toxic and hazardous waste dumps are located more often in inner city areas, and in areas that are predominately black and latino

1) Chicago's south side

2) 99 of 162 toxic hot spots in areas that are 65%

minority

3) 10 areas with highest lead poisoning 70 per cent, over

90% of cases

4) worst 5 of 6 areas for industrial pollution 78% minority

B. Most illegal dumping is in the inner city, half of city wards

that are 65% or more minority account for 80% of illegal dumping tonnage.

C. Indian reservations, among the poorest areas in the US, have taken nuclear and toxic waste in exchange for money from the government or private waste companies

D. Lifeboat theory is racist, overpopulation is not just us

vs them, it is global problem caused by global system

but also women and children in the third world

E.The US ships several million tones of toxic and hazardous waste to poor third world countries, Germany is the biggest exporters of toxic waste to the third world

"impeccable logic"

F. Migrant workers are subjected to pesticides. There is no law in the US that a farmer or agribusiness has to inform the migrant workers what or if they are being exposed to

G.Plantations workers are sprayed in the fields and in their villages near the fields by pesticides that are outlawed in the US, DDT

H. Air pollution is more concentrated in the inner city where the majority of poor minorities live

Young black men die of asthma at a rate of 3 times

that of young white men

African Americans have higher rates of environmental

cancer rates

III.. Not just a question of pollution and toxic dumps, delayed and ineffective action

A. EPA enforces its laws and regulations less vigorousl

B.it levied lower fines in poor minority areas, 1/5th

C. slower to put toxic waste sites on Superfund list

D.policy of containing waste, rathe than removing it, put

a tarp over it

1 billion to clean up Potomac, 3% of that to clean it up

II. Environmental Racism - Native Americans

A. Nuclear Waste

1. 104 US nuclear power plants

2. 22 in Canada

3. Waste

a. 70, 000 metric tons high level

b. millions of liquid

c. spent fuel rods

d. tailings

e. mines: 1000 alone on Navajo land

f. affected: Hopi, Navajo, Lakota, Apache, Laguna

Ojibwe, Ok tribes, Alabama-Coushatta, Yakama, and

Spokane

B. Western Shoshone

1. 1951 AEC set of nuclear test site in Nevada within

W Shoshone Res

2. 1951-1992 US and GB 1054, 220 above ground tests

3. government claim very little exposure, equivalent of

chest x-ray

4. 1997 National Cancer Institute study:

a.160 million persons 200x to 3000x the amount govt claimed

b. 75,000 cases of thyroid cancer, many still at risk

because of long latency period

5. AEC and DofE would wait until winds would blow

north and east so radiation wouldn't blow towards

Vegas or La, but toward the Shoshone

a. they would duck and cover

b. structures not air tight

c. work outside and hunted when clouds came over

d. gather water outside

e. not even evaluated by DoE

6. Government wants land

a. Shoshone title has been recognized

i. Treaty of Ruby Valley 1853

ii. Indian Claims Commission offered to buy

land based on 1873 value $26 million now

$91 million

7. Shosone refuse to sell

8. Govt wants put nuclear waste dump there

a. Monitored Retrieval Site

b. govt and nuclear industry have been funding

Native tribal organizations research into turning

reservations into MRS

9. Govt has decided to dump all nuclear waste in W

Shoshone land at Yucca mountain

a. Nuclear Energy Institute ( nuclear industry) spent $12.8 million to their congressional delegates to get this through

b. get it out of our back yard 1997 Nuclear

Waste Policy Act

Sen Rod Grams of Minn: "We in the Senate have done our part in trying to restore the promises mad by the fereal government to the ratpayers os this country to move nuclear waste our of our home states."

DOE: "Native responsiblity to hold nuclear waste emanates from the 'superior Native understandin of the natural world' and the fact tht we are 'our brother's keeper.'

c. operating reactors still have to store waste for

five to ten years

d. 15,000 shipments + will lead to 268 accidents as

shipments pass through areas with 50 million

C. Navajo and uranium mining - 1950 to 1980

1. The birth of the atomic age created the need for

uranium ore

2. some of the richest deposits of uranium ore are found

on the Navajo reservation and the Laguna Pueblo

a. Four Corners

b. Colorado Plateau

3. between towards the end of WWII, esp between1950 and 1980 uranium was mined

a. mining companies heavily subsidized

b. Kerr-McGee

4. many of the workers were Navajo, mines and

processing mills

a. who were poor and desperate for the wages that mining pays

b. and responding to the appeal of their country

5. however, neither the tribal councils nor the miners were told about the dangers

a. by the start of the Manhattan Project, it was

known that uranium and radium caused

lung disease, cancer, and other fatal problems

b. studies by Public Health Service confirmed this

beyond a doubt but the AEC

i. sole purchaser said it had no responsibility

for the safety of the mine

ii. and the mining companies resisted taking

any safety measures

iii. Secretary of the Interior took no action to

protect the workers

"They dug the uranium ore with pick and shovel in the small mines called 'dog holes' or blasted the rocks with dynamite, breathing radon gas and silica-laden dust. They ate food tainted with uranium oxide and drank the contaminated water that dripped from the mine walls. They carried uranium home to their wives and children on thier shoes, clothes, and bodies."

iii. no ventiliation system

no protective gear

iii. 20 years to impose limits for radiation

exposure

iv. after the deaths, mining cos and the gov

argued over who should compensate the victims or if any compesation was due

( few years after closing 1 in 5, cancer of

lungs, pulmonary fribrosis)

v. deaths are particularly bad

decimate small communities

leave families in poverty

c. Navajo fought fought congress and the courts in

70s and 80s

i. disregard for the rights of native peoples

ii. "discretionary function" - no court review of certain court functions (Federal Tort Claims

Act)

d. in 1990 Congress passed Radiation Exposure

Compensation Act

i. bureaucratic nightmare that natives have to

traverse

ii. slow processing of claims

iii. demands which subvert the intent of the

law

iv. this included the human guinea pigs,

fallout victims, other workers exposed

6. Not just death

1. left behind over 1000 mines uncapped

2. piles of radioactive mine waste ( tailings)

3. rain leaching uranium into ground water

4. small open pit mines filled with water inviting children to swim

5. Laguna Pueblo

i. 3000 acre open pit mine

ii. untouched for seven years after operations stopped

iii.pueblo started own reclamation

6. Shiprock

i. radioacative mill

ii. 70 acres of spent uranium with 85% of radioactivity

iii. about 20 yards from the San Juan river

7. Durango

i. Mt. Uranium tailings pile 23oo feet high

III. Environmental Racism - Native Americans

A. Mohawk

1. Akwesasne "Land Where the Partridge Drums"

2. 25 sq miles on St. Lawrence border between NY and

Canada

3. home to 8,000 Mohawks

4. GM factory Superfund site

a. 823, 000 cubic yards of PCB-contaminated

materials

b. land , water, and bodies

5. Traditionally fishers

a. whales polluted

b. turtles polluted- Mohawk legend - *Turtle Island*

"This used to be a fishing village. That's all gone now. There's only one family that still fishes. We can't farm here because of all of those air emissions. Industy has pretty much taken the entire traditional lifestyle away from the community here.

c. 65% of Mohawks on Adwasnes have diabetes

d. from fish to spaghetti

5. history of polluting Mohawk land

a. 1900s Aluminum Company of America factory

b. 1950s cheap power from St Lawrence and Moses

Sanders Power Dam lured giant coporations

i. GM and Reynolds

6. Reynolds

a. 400 pounds of fluorides per hour, reduced in

1973 to 75 pounds ber hourd

b. but

i. stock losses

ii. vegetation

7. Today 25% of all NA industry is located on or near the

Great Lakes which are drained by the St Lawrence

8. Canada as designated Akwesasne Mohawk Res as most

contaminated

9. US side, GM had 258 acres near res

a. five saturate dlagoons

b. numerous PCB laden sludge pits

c. lead, chromium, mercury, cadmium,

9a. GM one of the worst polluters in the world

a. 1994 Multinational Monitor Top Ten worst corp

b. potentially responsible for 200 Superfund sites

10. EPA fined GM for multiple violations of the Toxic

Substances Control ACt and added site to Superfund for

cleanup

11. EPA resolve has weakened from "treatment" to

"containment"

a. limits amount of cleanup to 1/3

b. saves GM $15million

12. GM cleanup

a. sand and grave over contaminated areas

13. Women's Milk Project

a. women are first environment

i. baby, mother, family

ii. everything the mother feels, eats, and sees

affects the baby

b. bioaccumulation analysis from fish to wildlife

to breast milk

c. 200x the PCP levels for mothers who ate fish from the St. Lawrence

i. example one woman: PCBs, HCBs, DDC,

mirex (a flame retardent)

ii. fish is traditional food

d. same in studies of fetal umbilical cords

14. GM fights every step of the way

a. did some dredging in 1998-99

b. but shipped them off to some unlucky site in

Utah

c. may identify more hot spots, and may do more

remediation

15. fight is going international POPs, persistent organic

pollutants "dirty dozen"

16. Every one carries 500 measurable chemicals in their

body that were not in existence prior to 1920

a. effect brain development and behavior

b. endocrine functions

c. immune systems

d. reproductive systems

e. 72,000 are used on a regular basis, less than

20% have been tested

Capitalism and the Environment

I. Capitalism and the Environment

A. It is necessary to look at the relationship of capitalism to

the environment first before we examine more fundamental

cultural relationship to the environment.

B. The logic of capitalism

1. capital or profit is a result of a combination of elements that constitute the means of production

a. industrialization - technologies of production

b. natural resources

c. the labor power of the worker

2. natural resources are transformed into commodities for consumption or to

3. supply the power for technology, water, steam,

coal, oil, natural gas, nuclear

B. Capitalism defines the natural world as that which can

be owned, private property

1. taken for granted now, this had to be enforced

militarily, legally, and ideologically

2. In pre-Industrial England much of land was commons, shared crops, shared grazing, wood

3. early rules for private property, John Locke

a. land is passive, is just there

b. person works the land

c. land becomes his

d. but limit, not so much land you exclude others

C. Natural world or nature to capitalism

1. raw material, no inherent value, simply instrument

a. a forest is a lumber yard to be or paper

b. a mountain side is a Rancho of condominiums

c. a river is power - 75,000 damns in US

d. wild animals are potential sea worlds. clothing,

or trophies

2. transformed to fill man's needs and desires

D. Marxism agrees with capitalism in its fundamental relationship to nature, Marx

1.nature is for man's digestion and enjoyment

2. nature is man's inorganic (non-living) body and an

instrument for his life activity

3. essence of man is utilizing nature as instrument and

means

4. would there be limits on socialism -- needs rather

than shaped desires

D. Continous production

E. But also capitalism depends on people internalizing

a way of life -- consumerism -- getting their identity,

not just from consuming, but from continuing to consume

the "new" -- each year the market place increases plus

10% in new items, that doesn't include "updated" items,

new cars, Ford Model T, and GM

II. Capitalism's two global faces: colonialism and neo-colonialism

A. the logic of the economic sytem, global or monopoly capitalism is accumulation and concentration of capital

B. expansion, and the exploitation and transformation of the

natural world into commodities

C. the logic of the political system is to establish a global

environment conducive to the above, penetration of capital

into all areas of the globe without restraint

guaranteed natural resources for the benefit of the

first world

cheap or slave labor from indigenous people, or the

elimination of those who were in the way

new markets for expansion

III. Colonialism: environment and indigenous people

A. The globalization of capitalism has its roots in colonialism

which involved the military conquest of the Americas, Africa,

and Asia in order to exploit there natural resources, labor,

and markets

B. Colonialism frequently precedented under the ideological

banner of "civilizing" the savages of the conquered colonies,

or eliminating them if they couldn't be civilized

"We govern them by sheer weight of character and without use of force" Lord Cromer, ruler of Egypt from 1883-1906

"In the Empire we have found not merely th key to glory and wealth, but the call to duty, and means of service to mankind." Lord Curzon, viceroy of India

The Seal of the Governor and Company of Mass Bay in 1629 depicts an India pleading "Come over and help us."

However, a question arises, is this a sufficient explanation to understand the causes of the environmental crisis. I believe we need to examine the cultural causes, and take a brief look at the history of western culture in relationship to its environment

There is a quite different point of view from those that are getting civilized

Nehru: "The ideology of British rule was that of the herrenvoldk and the maste race and idea inherent in imperialism."

D. And it could be argued that English rule of India not only

set them back -- they were highly advanced in ship building,

metal working, glass, and crafts -- England's goal was to

make them an agrarian society in service to Englands cotton

mills

E. India, Calcutta and Bengal, to Euro eyes, " a wonderful land

whose richness and abundance neither war, pestilance, nor

oppresion could destroy"

F. However, British policies did exactly that and the British

Settlement Act created that necessary elite of wealthy

and powerful who benefited from the occupation

G. Indias poverty now is the basis of its exploitation of

its natural world -- the Chipkas -- vulnerable to First World

H. The civilizing effects of western Europe and colonialism,

in that unique form called manifest destiny, is well known

I. It constitued the "concentrated task of felling trees and

Indians and of rounding out their natural boundaries

- Columbus himself exterminated the Taino Indians

from the face of the earth in his pursuit for non-

existent gold, the Indians, he described, as "so kind,

gentle, and willingly to share that they will be easily

used

-- with the destruction of the Taino went the destruction

of the natural ecosytems of much of the Caribbean, in

an effort to turn them into plantations

J. This compares favorably to the civilizing effects of

manifest destiny

" All other races must bow and fade before the great work of subjugation and conquest to be acheived by the Anglo-Saxon race"

"not one foot of what we have acquired has blood spattered on it"

K. Of course, the few remaining native Americans, 10% of

the original population, and those few remaining buffaloe, and

forests, if they could speak might say something differently

L. European colonization of NA may have been the swiftest

and most dramatic environmental change ever wrought by

human agency on the face of the earth up to that time

1) by 1640 trapped most fur bearing animals to

extinction in the lands they occupied, also in occupied

lands killed large herbivores to extinction, deed, moose,

2) vastly depleted game birds, turkey, duck, geese

3) by 1640 Eater deciduous forests wer depleted,

by the end of the seventeenth century one half

million acres were deforested, greatest deforestation

in human history

4) General destruction of ecosytem, loss of topsoil,

increased floods, low water tables

"all in all, the prsence of just a few hundred thousand of the European brach of the human spcies, within just a cnetury after its landin di more to alter the environment of NA than many millions of the Ameican branch had done in fifteen centuries or more.'

III. Neocolonialism, economic imperialism

A. After WWII the colonial empires broke down and

the US emerged as the most powerful country in the world,

the most powerful country ever

B. During the War the US and the allies had signed the Atlantic

Charter guaranteeing self-determination to countries after

the war

C. They were however deciding how to organize the globe in

a new fashion, this is now called economic and or cultural

imperialism, and it was couched in an ideology with less

racist overtones than "bringing civilization to savages" but it

is just as savage in its attack on the poor, the indigneous and

the environment, "devolopment" and "modernization"

D. In this system the third world is assigned the same role,

a service role: to provide resources, cheap labor, markets,

opportunities for investment, and export of pollution

E. Primary threat are those countries or movements that

wand to use the above for domestic needs.

F. E conflicts with a political and economic climate conducive

to priate investment and protection of our raw materials

NSC 5432/1, 1954 and George Kennan

G. Latin America should fulfill its service function, support

Guatemala, Nicaraqua, Chile, all anti- people and environment

H. Asia should be disuaded from independent developement.

"the US must find ways of exerting economic pressures on countries that do not accept their role as suppliers of "strategic commodities and other basic materials"

I. African resources, except white Africa should be directed at

rebuilding Europe

J. Middle East, energy system should be in US hands, operating

in manner designed by the British, Arab facade, family dictatorships

-- after overthrowing the parliamentary Mossadegh

regime

NYTimes "Underdeveloped conuntries with rich resources now have an object lesson i the heavy cost that must be paid by one of their number which goes beserk with fanatical nationalism" also Indonesia, E Timor, Guatemala, Vietname

K. It works through debt and military aid, US is last among

nations in foreign humanitarian aid, but first in military aid,

biggest part of debt of third world to first

I. political and social philosophies of the environment.

each is concerned with the **norm of social justice**

they are criticism of social arrangement and political and economic institutions

they reverse the domination argument, domination of man

and woman and race equals domination of nature

**The fundamental question**s that are asked of institutions is how do they function (manifest and latent) and who benefits and who is harmed.

**The inference t**hat underlies these theories is that if a society is comprised of institutions of domination it is more likely to be a society that dominates nature.

The **problem of social justic** is ambiguous at the philosophical leve, but with the contxt we have ben speaking we can sa it involves the ideas of equal respect, equal consideration of the suffering of others, love and sympathy for humans and no-human beings. **to what degree do institutions live up to this.**

II. John Rawl's "theory of justice"

A. What is the hypothetical situation that would create

the conditions for determing social justice for all

B. This would be the "veil of ignorance" where none

would know their position in the social world

C. given the veil of ignorance Rawl's argues that they

would agree on principles of equality, democratic

D. each individual is to have equal rights to the most

extensive system of liberties

E. social benefits and burdens should be distributed equally

unless an unequal distribution would benefit the least

advantaged members of society

F. and only if those benefits are attached to those positions to

which everyone has equal opportunity

Obviously, our system fails according to these principle.

III. Social Ecology and Murray Bookchin From bookchin's point of view, social institutions and arrangements are hierarchical with the few on the top benfiting while those on the bottom are oppressed

A. The **"logic of domination"** according to Bookchin is the logic of hierarchy -- superiority, inferiority, dominance and

oppression

B. **hieracrchies a**re by essence structures which are

asymmetrical power relationships, one group holds power

over another

C. all hierarchies are authoritarian, and are organized to

perpetuate themselves and those at the top, not a

**conspiracy**

D.beyond marxism, **eliminating class** (economic inequality

would not necessarily eliminate hierarchy, elite bureaucracy

over masses, men over women, ethnic group over ethnic

group, body over mind , spirit by shallow instrumental

rationality

E. hierarchy can be maintained by **coercion**, simple power, or

more insidiously it is maintained by **ideological institutions**,

specifically **education and the mass media**

F. in fact Bookchin thinks that the most dangerous forms of

hierarchy are perpetuated by people who have **internalized**

the dualism of inequality. See them **as justified**. The wealthy

worked for what he got.

G. Societies that are highly hiearchical have a relationship

of domination to nature

H. For bookchin these social, political and economic hierarchies create both the **psychology and the material conditions for the domination** of nature -- he has a social psychology, unfriendly technology

I. he has however a dialectical conception of the relationship of the individual and society, it is holistic in a sense but with the possibitlity of the individual acting

1) identity is mainly determined by society, social roles, history,circumstances, languages, practices etc.

in this sense the individual is a microcosm of the social worldof which he is a member, society has a life beyond the sum of the individuasl which make it up

2) if members of a society just internalize social reality, then they **reify** society, they just become functions of it,

3) however B thinks that the person can undertake **"self-determing activity"** through achieving his potential to become a **conscious thinking being**

4) how is this conscious self-determining actiity possible?

**non-coercive free society, no hierarchies**

J. what would be the model of the just community? similar to deep ecology, "libertarian anarchy"

decentralized, participatory democracy

cooperation rather than competion, it would

**approximate small ecosystem**s, diversified, balanced,

and harmonious

K. Relates to the practicies of sustainable agriculture

criticism:

human life is of a different order, defined by reason, idea of reason is naturalistic, can now guide evolution, "Captain Ahab"

ECOFEMINISM

I. The "logic of domination" according to the ecofeminist position is that society establishes dualism which are hierarchical, men are rational women are emotional

A. There is a value attribution to this dualism, reason is privileged, emotion is devalued. This value hierarchy is the bsis of domination

B. value relationships become a system of asymmetrical power relationship which in our society oppress women, feminine charac are devalued

C. There are several types of feminism, we are interested in **radical feminism,** their argument, biological differences

have been basis of domination, not class, social systems etc

D. cultural ecofeminism

accept distincitons -- women hve been identified in terms of

their body, child bearing, child raiser, sex object, domestic laborer

D.the site of a women's oppression is her body, like nature

it is devalued in relation to the order of being of man

E.o**ppression of both women and nature is similar**

F. ethics itself seems to fall in to this dualism,

1)ethics has since the enlightenment privileged the disengaged rational and abstract, **male qualities, moral realm** vs realm of nature

2) women's qualities omitted in ethics, caring, relationships, love, responsibility, trust

F. ecofeminists accept this distinction, but attempt to elevate it, **ethics of care**

1) concerete etics, the model of which is mother's care for

the child

"An ethics of care begins with a moral universe in which cooperation replaces conflict, relationships replace confrontation, and caring for the other replaces rights and duties. It is a moral universe in which motheing and friendship serve as morl ideals rathe than abstract princples like individual autonomy and freedom from interference."

240

2) women's identification as natural and therefore thier identity with the natural world formm this ethics of care an environmental ethics is derived care is extended to the natural world

3) the basis of this caring is not a principle but love, sympathy and respect, the concrete, not principles, but

models, how does the caring person act

II. The Third wave

I. Resistance

A. European Union

1. precautionary principle

2. extended producer responsibility aka Waste from

Electrical and Electronic Equipment (WEEE) proposal

a. phase out use of toxic metals like lead, cadmium,

and mercury in consumer items like refrigerators

and computers (40% of lead in landfills is from

electronic products)

b. require the use of a certain percentage of recycled materials

c. allow computers to more easily upgraded

d. manufacturers accepted financial and legal

responsibility throughout entire life cycle

e. by 2004 estimated 315 million obsolete computers

Martin Buber and Emmanuel Levinas

I. Critiques of the Self

A. Western philosophy and science start with or assume

the Cartesian ego as the fundamental reality -- ontology

B. Several philosophers in the western tradition have

been critical of this Cartesian-Lockean-Kantian tradition

C. Martin Heidegger, "The Question Concerning Technology"

Martin Buber, I and Thou

Immanuel Levinas, Infinity and Totality

D. There starting point is that the concept of an isolated I,

a subjectivity that stands over and against a world of

objects that are only externally related is wrong

E. Ethically this creates a hopeless situation, nothing can

really be justified by "principle," "calculation", or "analogy

that can be grounded

F. Ontology for all three, the fundamental reality, the

ultimate reality, is "being in the world" or as Heidegger points

out "being with others", "being with the world"

G. Martin Buber, a Jewish thinker, Hasidism, existentialism,

Kierkegaard ( all related to Kierkegaard), Taoism

H. Buber's ontology twofold I-Thou and I-It, I is different in each relationship

I. I of I it relationship is I of experience, manipulation, the

other as object, relationship as means to end

J. I of I thou relationship is I of openness, response to the

other, it is a personal relationship, of address and response

pure relation, can't bring it forth, like grace

K. Like the covenant, based on agreement and trust

L. The other asks a question which demands a response,

openness, recirpocity, mutuality

M. Response is risk, no guarantes, no laws to make it right,

"life on the narrow ridge" -- like Kierkegaard

N. in I and Thou Buber talks about the possibility of an

I thou relationship with nature, with a tree, with an animal

O. alienated man asks this question because indiginous people

already live in relation to their environment, and others, uses

language as an example

P. Yes, can you say thou to a tree, a mountain, an ecosystem

Q. It is reciprocal, can the tree say something to you, can it

ask you a question, make a demand upon you, for Buber,

the I Thou relationship can move beyond the threshold of

speech

R. Morality is response, not calculated, not principle, but response, the world as revelation and question, hallowing

the everyday, making the world a holy place, a place of

justice

S. Not a question of "What you should do?" not a third person

question, you're in the world as first person in relation

T. Between person and person, person and world

II. Levinas

A. Levinas says that when god asked Cain, Where is

your brother?

B. Levinas says that the I other relationship is the primary

ontological category, before all else one is in the world

in relation to the other

C. and that relationship is an ethical one, the other demands

of the I an ethical response, thou shalt not kill